# No: TC/G-55/35. dated 28 / 02 /2017.

To,

The Manager (C.B) Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority Karachi.

SUBJECT: -

NIT NO. TC/G-55/092, DATED 27/01/2017 (SR NO: 31398)

Enclosed kindly find herewith the Bid Evaluation report in light of Rule-45 of SPPRA rule-2010 of said NIT are submitted herewith for favour of your kind information please.

Executive Engineer
Highways Division
Tharparkar

Copy F.W.Cs to the Superintending Engineer Works and Services Tharparkar for information.

Executive Engineer Highways Division Tharparkar

NO: 08-03-17



# Office of the Executive Engineer Highways Division Tharparkar

No. TC/G-55/ 352 Highways Division Tharparkar Dated 28/62/2017.

#### SUBJECT: -

#### PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE METTING HELD ON 21-02-2017.

- A Meeting of the Procurement committee was held in the office of the Executive Engineer Highways Division Tharparkar under the Chairmanship of Superintending Engineer Works and Services Tharparkar.
- 2. The below mentioned members of committee attended the meeting to discuss the bids invited for the procurement of work vide Executive Engineer, Highways Division Tharparkar letter No. TC/G-55/092 dated 27/01/2017, and subsequently hoisted on the website of Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority and Information Technology Department Government of Sindh.

Following attended the meeting

 Mohammad Hashim Memon Superintending Engineer Works and Services Tharparkar Chairman

 Rasheed Ahmed Soomro Executive Engineer Public Health Division Tharparkar Member

 Niaz Ahmed Memon Executive Engineer Highways Division Tharparkar Member

3. committee.

During the course of meeting following discussion were made by the

- i. The tenders were received back from the bidders on dated 21-02-2017, 12.00 noon and opened @ 1.00 PM before the Procurement Committee in presence of representatives of participants.
- ii. The methods for bidding documents observed as single envelop.
- The tenders were opened on 21-02-2017 before the tender opening Committee.

4. During the opening of tenders received for work @ S.No. 01 to 05 of the NIT, the following status was found.

NIT Work Sr No.	Name of Firm	Ranking in terms of Cost	Remarks
1	M/S Joshi Engineering Works	1 <sup>st</sup> Lowest	Accepted
1	M/S Vikram Kumar	2 <sup>nd</sup>	Highest Rejected
2	M/S Joshi Engineering Works	1 <sup>st</sup> Lowest	Accepted
2	M/S Vikram Kumar	2 <sup>nd</sup>	Highest Rejected
	M/S Joshi Engineering Works	1 <sup>st</sup> Lowest	Accepted
3	M/S Lachmandas	2 <sup>nd</sup>	Highest Rejected
	M/S Vikram Kumar	3 <sup>rd</sup>	Highest Rejected
	M/S Joshi Engineering Works	1 <sup>st</sup> Lowest	Accepted
4	M/S Vikram Kumar	2 <sup>nd</sup>	Highest Rejected
	M/S Ghulam Hussain & Co	3 <sup>rd</sup>	Highest Rejected
	M/S Malani Construction Company	1 <sup>st</sup> Lowest	Accepted
5	M/S Vikram Kumar	2 <sup>nd</sup>	Highest Rejected
	M/S Kaybee Contractor	3 <sup>rd</sup>	Highest Rejected

5. The Committee thoroughly scrutinized each case/tender documents, comparing mathematically and financially with sanctioned estimates/bill of quantities and criteria for determining minimum qualification as per bidding documents.

#### 6. Recommendation

After Due deliberation / scrutiny of each tender document by the committee it was recommended that lowest evaluated responsive bidder may be awarded the respective tender.

#### 7. Decision

In view of Para No.6 of this report it is decided that tenders are being awarded to above mentioned lowest responsive bidder accordingly.

(Niaz Ahmed Memon)

Executive Engineer Highways Division

Tharparkar

(Rasheed Ahmed Soomro)

Executive Engineer Public Health Division

Tharparkar

(Mohammad Hashim Memon)

Superintending Engineer Works and Services

1. Name of Procuring Agency: Executive Engineer Highways Division Tharparkar.

2. Tender Reference No: TC/G-55/ 092 dated: 27-01-2017

3. Tender Description/Name of work/item: WIDENING / RECONDITIONING OF ROAD FROM GADHI BHIT TO D.C OFFICE CHOWK MILE 0/4-0/6 = 0.40 KMS.

4. Method of Procurement: Single Stage, one envelop Method.

5. Tender Published: Daily Jung on 01-02-2017 (SPPRA S No 31398)

Print & Electronic Media (SPPRA ID No. & News papers names with dates)

6. Total Bid documents Sold; 03

7. Total Bids Received: 03

8. Technical Bid Opening date: (if applicable) N/A (Provide details in separate form)

9. No. of Bid technically qualified (if applicable): N/A

10. Bid(s) Rejected:

11. Financial Bid Opening date:

21-02-2017

12. Bid Evaluation Report:

S.#	Name of Firm or Bidder	Cost offered by the Bidder	Ranking in terms of cost	Comparison with Estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance/ rejection	Remarks
0	1	2	3	4	5	6
1.	A Mr. Malani Construction Company	9906517	1 <sup>st</sup> Lowest	9916869/- 10352 Excess	Lowest	Accepted
2.	B Mr. Vikram Kumar	9925331	2 <sup>nd</sup> Higher	9916869/- 8462 Excess	Higher	Rejected
3.	C Mr. Kaybee Contractors	9943722	3 <sup>rd</sup> Highest	9916869/- 26903 Excess	Highest	Rejected

(Engr: Niaz Ahmed Memon) Executive Engineer Highways Division

Tharparkar

(Rasheed Ahmed Soomro) **Executive Engineer Public Health Division** 

Tharparkar

(Muhammad Hashim Memon) Superintending Engineer Works & Services

Tharparkar

1. Name of Procuring Agency: Executive Engineer Highways Division Tharparkar.

2. Tender Reference No:

TC/G-55/ 092 dated: 27-01-2017

3. Tender Description/Name of work/item: CONSTRUCTION OF ROAD TURKIA COLONY MITHI TOWN MILE 0/0-0/5 = 1.00 KMS.

4. Method of Procurement:

Single Stage, one envelop Method.

5. Tender Published:

Daily Jung on 01-02-2017 (SPPRA S No 31398)

Print & Electronic Media (SPPRA ID No. & News papers names with dates)

6. Total Bid documents Sold;

02

7. Total Bids Received:

02

8. Technical Bid Opening date: (if applicable) N/A (Provide details in separate form)

9. No. of Bid technically qualified (if applicable): N/A

10. Bid(s) Rejected:

11. Financial Bid Opening date:

21-02-2017

12. Bid Evaluation Report:

S.#	Name of Firm or Bidder	Cost offered by the Bidder	Ranking in terms of cost		parison with imated cost	Reasons for acceptance/rejection	Remarks
0	1	2	3		4	5	6
1.	A Mr. Joshi Engineering Works	10,782,904	1 <sup>st</sup> Lowest	107988 15953	857/- Excess	Lowest	Accepted
2.	B Mr. Vikram Kumar	10798221	2 <sup>nd</sup> Higher	107988 636 Sa	T POST	Higher	Rejected

Engr: Niaz Ahmed Memon) **Executive Engineer** 

**Highways Division** Tharparkar

Ahmed Soomro) **Executive Engineer Public Health Division** Tharparkar

(Muhammad Hashim Memon) Superintending Engineer Works & Services

Tharparker

1. Name of Procuring Agency: Executive Engineer Highways Division Tharparkar.

2. Tender Reference No:

TC/G-55/092 dated: 27-01-2017

3. Tender Description/Name of work/item: CONSTRUCTION OF ROAD FROM CHELHAR BHORELO ROAD TO VILLAGE PHULIO MILE 0/0-0/6 = 1.20 KMS.

4. Method of Procurement:

Single Stage, one envelop Method.

5. Tender Published:

Daily Jung on 01-02-2017 (SPPRA S No 31398)

Print & Electronic Media (SPPRA ID No. & News papers names with dates)

6. Total Bid documents Sold;

02

7. Total Bids Received:

02

8. Technical Bid Opening date: (if applicable) N/A (Provide details in separate form)

9. No. of Bid technically qualified (if applicable): N/A

10. Bid(s) Rejected:

0

11. Financial Bid Opening date:

21-02-2017 /

12. Bid Evaluation Report:

S.#	Name of Firm or Bidder	Cost offered by the Bidder	Ranking in terms of cost	Comparison w Estimated co	acceptance/	Remarks
0	1	2	3	4	5	6
1.	A Mr. Joshi Engineering Works	12715985	1 <sup>st</sup> Lowest	12728566/- 12580 Excess	Lowest	Accepted
2.	B Mr. Vikram Kumar	12731596	2 <sup>nd</sup> Higher	12728566/- 3030 Excess	Higher	Rejected

Engr: Niaz Ahmed Memon)
Executive Engineer
Highways Division

Tharparkar

(Rasheed Ahmed Soomro) Executive Engineer Public Health Division Tharparkar (Muhammad Hashim Memon) Superintending Engineer Works & Services

1. Name of Procuring Agency: Executive Engineer Highways Division Tharparkar.

2. Tender Reference No: TC/G-55/ 092 dated: 27-01-2017

3. Tender Description/Name of work/item: CONSTRUCTION OF ROAD FROM PHANGHARIO SUKHO BHEEL PARO MILE 0/0-0/2+330 = 0.50 KMS.

4. Method of Procurement: Single Stage, one envelop Method.

5. Tender Published: Daily Jung on 01-02-2017 (SPPRA S No 31398)

Print & Electronic Media (SPPRA ID No. & News papers names with dates)

6. Total Bid documents Sold;

03

7. Total Bids Received:

03

8. Technical Bid Opening date: (if applicable) N/A (Provide details in separate form)

9. No. of Bid technically qualified (if applicable): N/A

10. Bid(s) Rejected:

11. Financial Bid Opening date:

21-02-2017

12. Bid Evaluation Report:

S.#	Name of Firm or Bidder	Cost offered by the Bidder	Ranking in terms of cost	Comparison with Estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance/ rejection	Remarks
0	1	2	3	4	5	6
1.	A Mr. Joshi Engineering Works	4946353	1 <sup>st</sup> Lowest	4951353/- 5000 Saving	Lowest	Accepted
2.	B Mr. Lachmandas	4950009	2 <sup>nd</sup> Higher	4951353/- 1344 Saving	Higher	Rejected
3.	C Mr. Vikram Kumar	4952426	3 <sup>rd</sup> Highest	4951353/- 1073 Excess	Highest	Rejected

(Engr: Niaz Ahmed Memon) **Executive Engineer** 

**Highways Division** Tharparkar

(Rasheed Ahmed Soomro) **Executive Engineer Public Health Division** Tharparkar

(Muhammad Hashim Memon) Superintending Engineer Works & Services

Tharparkar

1. Name of Procuring Agency: Executive Engineer Highways Division Tharparkar.

2. Tender Reference No:

TC/G-55/ 092 dated: 27-01-2017

3. Tender Description/Name of work/item: CONSTRUCTION OF ROAD FROM MITHI NABISAR ROAD
TO BHANANI BHEEL MILE 0/0-0/5 = 1.00 KMS

4. Method of Procurement:

Single Stage, one envelop Method.

5. Tender Published:

Daily Jung on 01-02-2017 (SPPRA S No 31398)

Print & Electronic Media (SPPRA ID No. & News papers names with dates)

6. Total Bid documents Sold;

03

7. Total Bids Received:

03

8. Technical Bid Opening date: (if applicable) N/A (Provide details in separate form)

9. No. of Bid technically qualified (if applicable): N/A

10. Bid(s) Rejected:

0

11. Financial Bid Opening date:

21-02-2017

12. Bid Evaluation Report:

S.#	Name of Firm or Bidder	Cost offered by the Bidder	Ranking in terms of cost	Comparison with Estimated cost	Reasons for acceptance/rejection	Remarks
0	1	2	3	4	5	6
1.	A Mr. Joshi Engineering Works	11,136568	1 <sup>st</sup> Lowest	11148139/- 11572 Saving	Lowest	Accepted
2.	B Mr. Vikram Kumar	11154767	2 <sup>nd</sup> Higher	11148139/- 6628 Excess	Higher	Rejected
3.	C Mr. Ghulam Hussain & Co	11176545	3 <sup>rd</sup> Highest	11148139/- 28406 Excess	Highest	Rejected

(Engr: Niaz Ahmed Memon) Executive Engineer Highways Division

Tharparkar

(Rasheed Ahmed Soomro) Executive Engineer Public Health Division Tharparkar (Muhammad Hashim Memon)
Superintending Engineer
Works & Services
Tharparkar

Method and procedure of procurement

Open Competitive Bidding (National Competitive Bidding) (Single stage one Envelope)

DESCRIPTION OF WORK:-

WIDENING / RECONDITIONING OF ROAD FROM GADHI BHIT TO D.C OFFICE CHOWK MILE 0/4-0/6 = 0.40 KMS.

### BIDDER ELIGIBILITY / QUALIFICATION REPORT

Eligibility Qualification Criteria

S#.	Eligibility Qualification Criteria	M/S Malani Construction Company	M/S Vikram Kumar	M/S Kaybee Contractor
01	Registration with PEC	Yes	Yes	Yes
02	NTN	Yes	Yes	Yes
03	Sale Tax Registration	Yes	Yes	Yes
04	Professional Tax	Yes	Yes	Yes
Qual	lification Criteria			
05	Minimum three experience of relevant	Yes	Yes	Yes
06	Turnover of at least three years	Yes	Yes	Yes
07	Required Bid security is attached	Yes	Yes	Yes
08	Bid is signed named and stamped by the authorized person of the firm	Yes	Yes	Yes
09	Qualified / disqualified	Qualified	Qualified	Qualified

(Rasheed Ahmed Soomro)

Executive Engineer Public Health Division Tharparkar (Engr: Niaz Ahmed Memon)

Executive Engineer Highways Division Tharparkar (Muhammad Hashim Memon)

Name of Schemes:- Widening / Reconditioning of road from Gadhi Bhit to D.C Office Chowk mile 0/4-0/6 = 0.40 Kms.

Date of Issue: - 20/02 /2017

NIT NO.TC/G-55 / 092 /2017 Dated 27/01/2017

Date of Opening: - 21/02/2017

	Estimated Cost 10.000 Million			Rate	quoted by Contractor.				
S#.			Name o	Name of Contractor		Name of Contractor		of Contractor	
	Item of Work			M/S Malani Construction Company		M/S Vikram Kumar		M/S Kaybee Contractors	
1	Part- A Road Work		7.90%	Above	7.95%	Above	8.00%	Above	
2	Part-B Protection Wall/Toe Wall		51.50%	Above	53.00%	Above	55.00%	Above	
3	Part-C T.R Painting & Cateyes		0.15%	Below	2.00%	Above	3.00%	Above	

Certified that the Rates Part-A 7.90% Above, Part-B 51.50% Above, & Part-C 0.15% Below, quoted by M/S MALANI CONSTRUCTION COMPANY Govt: Contractor are

found lowest.

(Rasheed Ahmed Soomro)

**Executive Engineer** Public Health Division

Tharparkar

(Engr: Niaz Ahmed Memon)

**Executive Engineer** 

**Highways Division** 

Tharparkar

(Muhammad Hashim Memon)

Superintending Engineer

Works and Services

Method and procedure of procurement

Open Competitive Bidding (National Competitive Bidding) (Single stage one Envelope)

DESCRIPTION OF WORK:-

CONSTRUCTION OF ROAD FROM CHELHAR BHORELO ROAD TO VILLAGE PHULIO MILE 0/0-0/6 = 1.20 KMS.

### BIDDER ELIGIBILITY / QUALIFICATION REPORT

Eligibility Qualification Criteria

S#.	Eligibility Qualification Criteria	M/S Joshi Engineering Works	M/S Vikram Kumar	
01	Registration with PEC	Yes	Yes	
02	NTN	Yes	Yes	
03	Sale Tax Registration	Yes	Yes	
04	Professional Tax	Yes	Yes	
Qual	lification Criteria			
05	Minimum three experience of relevant	Yes	Yes	
06	Turnover of at least three years	Yes	Yes	
07	Required Bid security is attached	Yes	Yes	
08	Bid is signed named and stamped by the authorized person of the firm	Yes	Yes	
09	Qualified / disqualified	Qualified	Qualified	

(Rasheed Ahmed Soomro)

Executive Engineer Public Health Division Tharparkar (Engr: Niaz Ahmed Memon)

Executive Engineer Highways Division Tharparkar (Muhammad Hashim Memon)

Name of Schemes:- Construction of Road from Chelhar Bhorelo road to village Phulio mile 0/0-0/6 = 1.20 Kms.

Date of Issue: - 20/02 /2017

Date of Opening: - 21/02/2017

	Estimated Cost 12.8520 Million Earnest Money 260000			Rate quoted by Contractor.	
S#			Name of Contractor	Name of Contractor	Name of Contractor
	Item of Work	M/S Joshi Engineering Works	M/S Vikram Kumar		

8.00% Above 7.90% Above 1 Part- A Road Work Part-B Protection Wall/Toe Wall 62.50% Above 65.00% Above

Certified that the Rates Part-A 7.90% Above, Part-B 62.50% Above, quoted by M/S JOSHI ENGINEERING WORKS Govt: Contractor are found lowest.

(Rasheed Ahmed Soomro)

NIT NO.TC/G-55 / 092 /2017 Dated 27/01/2017

**Executive Engineer** Public Health Division

Tharparkar

(Engr: Niaz Ahmed Memon)

**Executive Engineer Highways Division** 

Tharparkar

(Muhammad Hashim Memon)

Superintending Engineer

Works and Services

Method and procedure of procurement

Open Competitive Bidding (National Competitive Bidding) (Single stage one Envelope)

DESCRIPTION OF WORK:-

CONSTRUCTION OF ROAD FROM PHANGHARIO SUKHO BHEEL PARO MILE 0/0-0/2+330 = 0.50 KMS.

### BIDDER ELIGIBILITY / QUALIFICATION REPORT

Eligibility Qualification Criteria

S#.	Eligibility Qualification Criteria	M/S Joshi Engineering Works	M/S Lachmandas	M/S Vikram Kumar
01	Registration with PEC	Yes	Yes	Yes
02	NTN	Yes	Yes	Yes
03	Sale Tax Registration	Yes	Yes	Yes
04	Professional Tax	Yes	Yes	Yes
Qual	lification Criteria			
05	Minimum three experience of relevant	Yes	Yes	Yes
06	Turnover of at least three years	Yes	Yes	Yes
07	Required Bid security is attached	Yes	Yes	Yes
08	Bid is signed named and stamped by the authorized person of the firm	Yes	Yes	Yes
09	Qualified / disqualified	Qualified	Qualified	Qualified

(Rasheed Ahmed Soomro)

Executive Engineer Public Health Division

Tharparkar

(Engr: Niaz Ahmed Memon)

Executive Engineer Highways Division Tharparkar (Muhammad Hashim Memon)

Name of Schemes:- Construction of Road from Phanghario Sukho Bheel Paro mile 0/0-0/2+330 = 0.50 Kms.

Date of Issue: -

Date of Opening: - 21/02/2017

20/02 /2017

NIT NO.TC/G-55 / 092 /2017 Dated 27/01/2017

	Estimated Cost 5.000 Million Earnest Money 100000		Rate quoted by Contractor.						
S#.	Item of Work  Part- A Road Work				ne of Contractor N		ame of Contractor		
					M/S Lachmandas		M/S Vikram Kumar		
1			7.90%	Above	7.95%	Above	8.00%	Above	
3	Part-B Protection Wall/Toe Wall		52.00%	Above	55.00%	Above	58.00%	Above	

Certified that the Rates Part-A 7.90% Above, Part-B 52.00% Above, quoted by M/S JOSHI ENGINEERING WORKS Govt: Contractor are found lowest.

(Rasheed Anmed Soomro) **Executive Engineer** 

Public Health Division

Tharparkar

(Engr: Niaz Ahmed Memon)

**Executive Engineer** 

Highways Division

Tharparkar

(Muhammad Hashim Memon)

Superintending Engineer

Works and Services

Method and procedure of procurement

Open Competitive Bidding (National Competitive Bidding) (Single stage one Envelope)

DESCRIPTION OF WORK:-

CONSTRUCTION OF ROAD TURKIA COLONY MITHI TOWN MILE 0/0-0/5 = 1.00 KMS.

### BIDDER ELIGIBILITY / QUALIFICATION REPORT

Eligibility Qualification Criteria

S#.	Eligibility Qualification Criteria	M/S Joshi Engineering Works	M/S Vikram Kumar	
01	Registration with PEC	Yes	Yes	
02	NTN	Yes	Yes	
03	Sale Tax Registration	Yes	Yes	
04	Professional Tax	Yes	Yes	
Qual	lification Criteria			
05	Minimum three experience of relevant	Yes	Yes	
06	Turnover of at least three years	Yes	Yes	
07	Required Bid security is attached	Yes	Yes	
08	Bid is signed named and stamped by the authorized person of the firm	Yes	Yes	
09	Qualified / disqualified	Qualified	Qualified	

(Rasheed Ahmed Soomro)

zex cely

Executive Engineer Public Health Division

Tharparkar

(Engr: Niaz Ahmed Memon)

Executive Engineer Highways Division Tharparkar (Muhammad Hashim Memon)

Name of Schemes:- Construction of Road Turkia Colony Mithi Town mile 0/0-0/5 = 1.00 Kms.

Date of Issue: -

20/02 /2017

NIT NO.TC/G-55 / 092 /2017 Dated 27/01/2017

Date of Opening: - 21/02/2017

S#.	Estimated Cost 10.898 Million	Earnest Money 220000		Rate quoted by Contractor.					
	Item of Work		Name o	Name of Contractor  M/S Joshi Engineering Works		Name of Contractor  M/S Vikram Kumar		Name of Contractor	
			M/S Joshi Er						
1	Part- A Road Work		7.85%	Above	7.90%	Above			
2	Part- B Culverts		30.00%	Above	32.00%	Above			
3	Part-C Protection Wall/Toe Wall		53.40%	Above	55.00%	Above			

Certified that the Rates Part-A 7.85% Above, Part-B 30.00% Above, and Part-C 53.40% Above quoted by M/S JOSHI ENGINEERING WORKS Govt: Contractor are found lowest.

(Rasheed Ahmed Soomro)

Executive Engineer Public Health Division

Tharparkar

(Engrt Niaz Ahmed Memon)

**Executive Engineer** 

Highways Division Tharparkar (Muhammad Hashim Memon) Superintending Engineer

Works and Services Tharparkar

Method and procedure of procurement

Open Competitive Bidding (National Competitive Bidding) (Single stage one Envelope)

DESCRIPTION OF WORK:-

CONSTRUCTION OF ROAD FROM MITHI NABISAR ROAD TO BHANANI BHEEL MILE 0/0-0/5 = 1.00 KMS.

### BIDDER ELIGIBILITY / QUALIFICATION REPORT

Eligibility Qualification Criteria

S#.	Eligibility Qualification Criteria	M/S Joshi Engineering Works	M/S Vikram Kumar	M/S Ghulam Hussain & Co	
01	Registration with PEC	Yes	Yes		
02	NTN	N Yes Yes		Yes	
03	Sale Tax Registration	e Tax Registration Yes Yes		Yes	
04	Professional Tax	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Qual	lification Criteria				
05	Minimum three experience of relevant	Yes	Yes	Yes	
06	Turnover of at least three years	Yes	Yes	Yes	
07	Required Bid security is attached	Yes	Yes	Yes	
08	Bid is signed named and stamped by the authorized person of the firm	Yes	Yes	Yes	
09	Qualified / disqualified	Qualified	Qualified	Qualified	

(Rasheed Anmed Soomro)
Executive Engineer
Public Health Division

Tharparkar

(Engr: Niaz Ahmed Memon)

Executive Engineer Highways Division Tharparkar (Muhammad Hashim Memon)

Superintending Engineer

Works and Services

Name of Schemes:- Construction of Road from Mithi Nabisar road to Bhanani Bheel mile 0/0-0/5 = 1.00 Kms.

Date of Issue: -

20/02 /2017

NIT NO.TC/G-55 / 092 /2017 Dated 27/01/2017

Date of Opening: - 21/02/2017

	Estimated Cost 11.250 Million	Earnest Money 225000	Rate quoted by Contractor.					
S#.	Item of Work				Name of Contractor		Name of Contractor	
					M/S	M/S Vikram Kumar		M/S Ghulam Hussain & Co
1	Part- A Road Work		7.90%	Above	7.95%	Above	8.00%	Above
2	Part- B Culverts		29.40%	Above	32.00%	Above	35.00%	Above
3	Part-C Protection Wall/Toe Wall		53.00%	Above	55.00%	Above	58.00%	Above

Certified that the Rates Part-A 7.90% Above, Part-B 29.40% Above, & Part-C 53.00% Above, quoted by M/S JOSHI ENGINEERING WORKS Govt: Contractor are found

lowest.

(Rasheed Amed Soomro)

Executive Engineer
Public Health Division

Tharparkar

(Engr: Niaz Ahmed Memon)

**Executive Engineer** 

**Highways Division** 

Tharparkar

(Muhammad Hashim Memon)

**Superintending Engineer** 

Works and Services