

MINUTES OF MEETING ON CONSULTANTS SELECTION COMMITTEE THARPARKAR REGARDING OPENING OF TECHNICAL PROPOSALS FOR ESTABLISHMENT OF CADET COLLEGE MITHI DISTRICT THARPARKAR HELD ON 17-01-2012 IN THE OFFICE OF EXECUTIVE ENGINEER EDUCATION WORKS DIVISION THARPARKAR @ MITHI.

The List of participants is attached separately

The Meeting started under chairmanship of Superintending Engineer Works & Services Department Tharparkar @ Mithi.

At the out set Executive Engineer Education Works Division Tharparkar @ Mithi informed the committee that in the start of process Expression of Interest were obtained from intended leading consulting firms of the country through this office letter No. DO (E.W/TC/ 835 dated 27-10-2011.

After observing necessary codal requirements under SPPRA Rules 2010, out of 6 (Six) intending Firms, 03 were short listed leaving 3 Firms, who qualified the prescribed criteria as under:-

1. M/S Allied Engineering Consultants Engineering
2. M/S Young Associates Consulting Engineers And Architects Karachi.
3. M/S Osmani & Company.

All the firms were informed about their eligibility separately. Afterwards Request for Proposals were issued to qualified firms mentioned above vide this office letter Nos.

- i. No. XEN (E.W)/ TC / 1125 dated 22-12-2011.
- ii. No. XEN (E.W)/ TC / 1126 dated 22-12-2011.
- iii. No. XEN (E.W)/ TC / 1127 dated 22-12-2011.

Only (02) firms M/S Allied Engineering Consultants Engineering and M/S Young Associates Consultants Engineers and Architects Karachi responded the Request for Proposal and no response was received from M/S Osmani & Company. The Technical Proposal of consultants were opened. As per grading procedures and method of selection mentioned in the evaluation criteria (appended with data sheet of the consultancy service for the project section-vi). The marks obtained by the each firms are as under:-

1. M/S Young Associates Consulting Engineers And Architects Karachi. **75 Marks**
2. M/S Allied Engineering Consultants Engineering **63 Marks**

Observation on the Technical proposal of the firms are attached herewith. Keeping in view the observations noted, finally committee decided that Technical Proposal of M/S Allied Engineering Consultant is found non responsive, thus Financial Proposal should be returned un- opened whereas financial proposal of M/S Young Associates Consulting Engineers and Architects Karachi who secured qualified marks in technical proposal may be opened on 01-02-2012. The participating consultants may be informed accordingly.

The meeting ended with vote of thanks to and from the chair.

## EVALUATION CRITERIA

Name of Agency: - M/S YOUNG ASSOCIATES CONSULTING ENGINEERS & ARCHITECTS

S.NO	NAME OF ITEM	TOTAL MARKS	OBTAINED MARKS
i)	Valid PEC Consulting Engineer License for the year 2011 and beyond (Mandatory Requirement) – Consultants to provide copy of PEC Consulting Engineer License in their own name valid for year 2010 or beyond – The same will be confirmed from PEC. Registration with PCATP		
	Registration with PCATP - 02 Points Specialization Categories in PEC License	10 Points	06
	1201 Public building & Office (ii) Commercial Building and Office (iii) Residential Building and houses (iv) Hotels and Motels (v) Hospitals, medical facilities, laboratories, medical research (vi) Educational facilities and complexes (vii) Recreation and Sports facilities, stadiums (viii) Libraries, Museums, Galleries - 02 Points	✓	
	1203 (i) Urban Developments, Housing Estates (ii) Industrial Estates, Industrial Complexes (iii) Urban Roads and Surface Drainage- 02 Points		
	1204 (i) Urban Sewerage & Water Supply (ii) Solid Waste Collection & Disposal (iii) Water Treatment Plants (iv) Sewage Treatment Plants -02 Points		
	1231 Landscaping & Horticulture – 02 Points		
ii)	Date of Establishment of the firm – Consultant to provide evidence of Establishment of date One Point for each year. 10 years or more – Full 10 points	10 Points	10
iii)	Office Construction – Consultant to provide address, phone numbers and contact person at each office for counter verification. Office in Karachi/Hyderabad 2 Points Offices other than Karachi & Hyderabad – 1 point for each office outside Karachi & Hyderabad (Out side Sindh Province) – Maximum 3 Points	05 Points	03
iv)	Financial Standing of the Firm Average Annual Turn-over for the last 5 years - Consultants to provide Audited Balance Sheets for the last 5 years Rs. 200 M and above – 10 Points Rs. 150 to 200 M – 7 Points Rs. 100 to 150 M – 4 Points Rs. 50 to 100 M – 2 Points Less than Rs. 50 M – 0 Points	10 Points	02
iv)	Specific experience of the Consultant relevant to the assignment	18 Points	
	Similar Education facilities: Designed & Executed - Consultant to provide copy of letter of award or client's certificate for each project. Each – 3 Points (09 Points) 3 or more min. Full 9 Points		09
	Other Education Institutions - Consultant to provide copy of letter of award or PA's certificate for each project. Each Institution – 1 Point (03 Points) 3 or more – Full 3 Points		03
	Other Projects more than Rs.500 M - Consultant to provide copy of letter of award or client's certificate for each project. Each Project other than Education Institution – 2 Points (06 points) 3 or more Full 6 Points		02

(v)	Adequacy of the proposed methodology and work plan in responding to the Terms of Reference	20 Points	
	a) Technical approach and methodology (8 Points)		06
	b) Work Plan (8 Points)		06
	c) Staffing Plan & Organization (4 Points)		03
vi)	Key professional staff qualifications and competence for the assignment: (Minimum Qualification & Experience is mentioned in the following table. If a proposed professional does not meet the minimum qualification, he / she shall be given 0 points)	27 Points	
	a) Team Leader / Lead Architect: M.E/M.sc in relevant field Each Projects of Similar Education Institution – 2 Points (6 Points) 3 or More – Full 06 Points		06
	b) Sr. Architect: Bachelor of Architecture Each Projects of Similar Education Institution – 1 Points (3 points) 3 or More – Full 3 Points		03
	c) Lead Structural Design Engineer: M.E/M.sc in relevant field Each Project of Similar Education Institution/ Other Institutions – 1 Points (3 points) 3 or More – Full 3 Points		01
	d) Structural Design Engineer: Bachelor of Engineering (civil) Each Project Similar Education Institution/ Other Institutions – 1 Points (3 points) 3 or More – Full 3 Points		03
	e) Lead MEP Engineer: BE (Mechanical/Electrical) Each Projects of Education Institution/ Other Institutions – 1 Points (3 points) 3 or More – Full 3 Points		03
	f) Lead Contracts Engineer: Bachelor of Engineering/Procurement Each Project of Education Institution/ Other Institutions – 1 Points (3 points) 3 or More – Full 3 Points		03
	g) Lead Quantity Surveyor: Diploma in Civil Engineering Each Project Educational/Other Institutions - 1 Point (3 points) 3 or More - Full 3 Points		03
	h) Resident Engineer proposed for this project: BE(Civil) Each Project of Education/Other Institutions 1-Point (3 points) 3 or More Full 3-Points		03
			<u>75</u>

minimum Qualifying Points for Technical Proposal: 60% Points

*[Signature]*  
 DIVISIONAL ACCOUNTS OFFICER  
 EDUCATION WORKS DIVISION  
 THARPARKAR @ MITHI

*[Signature]*  
 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER  
 EDUCATION WORKS DIVISION  
 THARPARKAR @ MITHI

*[Signature]*  
 DISTRICT OFFICER  
 PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT  
 DISTRICT OFFICER  
 (PLANNING)

DISTRICT GOVT THARPARKAR  
 @ MITHI

*[Signature]*  
 SUPERVISING ENGINEER  
 WORKS SERVICES DEPARTMENT  
 THARPARKAR @ MITHI

*[Signature]*  
 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER  
 THARPARKAR @ MITHI

Deputy Commissioner  
 Tharparkar

(v)	Adequacy of the proposed methodology and work plan in responding to the Terms of Reference	20 Points	
	a) Technical approach and methodology (8 Points)		02
	b) Work Plan (8 Points)		01
	c) Staffing Plan & Organization (4 Points)		
vi)	Key professional staff qualifications and competence for the assignment: (Minimum Qualification & Experience is mentioned in the following table. If a proposed professional does not meet the minimum qualification, he / she shall be given 0 points)	27 Points	
	a) Team Leader / Lead Architect: M.E/M.sc in relevant field Each Projects of Similar Education Institution – 2 Points (6 Points) 3 or More– Full 06 Points		06
	b) Sr. Architect: Bachelor of Architecture Each Projects of Similar Education Institution – 1 Points (3 points) 3 or More– Full 3 Points		03
	c) Lead Structural Design Engineer: M.E/M.sc in relevant field Each Project of Similar Education Institution/ Other Institutions – 1 Points (3 points) 3 or More– Full 3 Points		03
	d) Structural Design Engineer: Bachelor of Engineering (civil) Each Project Similar Education Institution/ Other Institutions – 1 Points (3 points) 3 or More– Full 3 Points		02
	e) Lead MEP Engineer: BE (Mechanical/Electrical) Each Projects of Education Institution/ Other Institutions – 1 Points (3 points) 3 or More – Full 3 Points		02
	f) Lead Contracts Engineer: Bachelor of Engineering/Procurement Each Project of Education Institution/ Other Institutions – 1 Points (3 points) 3 or More– Full 3 Points		02
	g) Lead Quantity Surveyor: Diploma in Civil Engineering Each Project Educational/Other Institutions - 1 Point (3 points) 3 or More - Full 3 Points		03
	h) Resident Engineer proposed for this project: BE(Civil) Each Project of Education/Other Institutions 1-Point (3 points) 3 or More Full 3-Points		03
			<u>63</u>

Minimum Qualifying Points for Technical Proposal: 60% Points

*[Signature]*  
 DIVISIONAL ACCOUNTS OFFICER  
 EDUCATION WORKS DIVISION  
 THARPARKAR @ MITHI

*[Signature]*  
 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER  
 EDUCATION WORKS DIVISION  
 THARPARKAR @ MITHI

*[Signature]*  
 DISTRICT OFFICER  
 PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT  
 THARPARKAR @ MITHI  
 (PLANNING)  
 DISTRICT GOVT. THARPARKAR @ MITHI

*[Signature]*  
 SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER  
 WORKS & SERVICES DEPARTMENT  
 THARPARKAR @ MITHI

*[Signature]*  
 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER  
 THARPARKAR @ MITHI  
 Deputy Commissioner  
 Tharparkar

**OBSERVATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSALS FOR CONSULTANCY SERVICES BY THE FIRMS REGARDING SCHEME ESTABLISHMENT OF CADET COLLEGE @ MITHI DISTRICT THARPARKAR ( OPENED ON 17-01-2012)**

M/S ALLIED ENGINEERING CONSULTANTS (PVT LIMITED LAHORE)	S.#	M/S YOUNG ASSOCIATES CONSULTING ENGINEERS AND ARCHITECTS KARACHI.
<p>Technical proposals submitted by representative of firm is not accompanied with power of attorney. Pre-requisite initials on each page of technical proposal are not available in accordance under Para 11.2.RFP.</p>	1	<p>Financial status is not supported with audited balance sheet as per sanction - (iv) Evaluation Criteria.</p>
<p>On enquiry over telephone from Regional offices it was informed. Telephone number 021-35855571 that place in question was a private residential bungalow not consultants office.                      (ii) At Rawalpindi office number 0321-5013763; Khizr Adil told that it is a private bungalow.                      (iii) On Cell number 0300-6050176, Engineer Safdar Hussain informed that he is running office at his own basis in Gilgit Baltistan and is not allied with at any other firm.                      (iv) The telephone # 091-5200283 at Peshwar office was found un-responded. Thus the firm misled facts leads to dis-qualification as per Tech-1 of RFP.</p>	2	<p>Lead Structural Design Engineer of firm is less qualified. But experienced.</p>
<p>Information furnished is not in accordance with Tech-2 and Tech-7. The forms are in-appropriate and improperly filled-in where lot of deficiencies were found resultantly to be rejected.</p>		
<p>Form- Tech-4 the consultants says that the soil investigation will be carried out on request of client at his cost separately which is not acceptable as per TOR, the rates for same are also demanded in the financial proposal which is duplication and leads to non-responsive as per clause-9 of RFP.</p>		

*[Signature]*  
 REGIONAL ACCOUNTS OFFICER  
 EDUCATION WORKS DIVISION  
 THARPARKAR @ MITHI

*[Signature]*  
 SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER  
 WORKS & SERVICES DEPARTMENT  
 THARPARKAR @ MITHI

*[Signature]*  
 ENGINEER  
 EDUCATION WORKS DIVISION  
 THARPARKAR @ MITHI

*[Signature]*  
 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER  
 THARPARKAR @ MITHI

*[Signature]*  
 DISTRICT OFFICER  
 PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT  
 THARPARKAR @ MITHI  
 DISTRICT GOVT THARPARKAR @ MITHI,

*[Signature]*  
 As per Tech-4

*[Signature]*  
 As per Tech-1 & 2