

# DIRECTORATE OF URBAN POLICY & STRATEGIC PLANNING PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT



#### GOVERNMENT OF SINDH

No. P&D/Directorate(UP&SP)/Pro/2016/1/25

Karachi, dated 9th September, 2016

Assistant Director (Asmt), Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority (SPPRA), Government of Sindh, Karachi.

Subject:

NIT NO. P&D/ DIRECTORATE (UP&SP) pro/2016/2336 dated 17.08.2016 (Sr.

No. 29729)

I am directed to refer to your office letter No. AD (ASMT/SPPRA/UP&SP-29729) 2016-17/ 1660 dated, August 29<sup>th</sup> 2016 on above subject.

2. The requested documents i.e. Evaluation Report of Expression of Municipal Finance Assessment Study for Sindh are enclosed herewith for your record and hoisting on SPPRA website.

(NABESH AKHTAR)

Deputy Director - (Produrement)

## Enclosure:

Evaluation of EOIs

10 pages

#### A copy is forwarded for information to:

- The Director (AF&M), Directorate of UP&SP, Sindh, Karachi
- The Director (UP&P), Directorate of UP&SP, Sindh, Karachi
- P.S to Additional Chief Secretary (Dev.), P&D Department, GoS, Karachi.
- ES to Director General, Directorate of UP&SP, Sindh, Karachi
- · The Staff Officer to MD, SPPRA, Karachi

Deputy Director - Procurement





Subject:

MINUTES OF THE CONSULTANT SELECTION COMMITTEE (CSC) MEETING – EVALUATION OF EXPRESSIONS OF INTEREST (EOIs) FOR MUNICIPAL FINANCE ASSESSMENT STUDY FOR SINDIH.

A meeting of Consultant Selection Committee (CSC) was held under the Chairmanship of Director General, Directorate of Urban Policy & Strategic Planning (UP&SP), Planning & Development Department, Government of Sindh on 4<sup>th</sup> August, 2016 at 04 00 PM in the committee room of the Directorate for evaluation of Expression of Interest (EOIs) submitted by the interested firms for Municipal Finance Assessment Study for Sindh.

2. The Secretary, Consultant Selection Committee informed the Committee that M/s. Grant Thornton Consulting (Pvt.) Limited associated with EA Consulting (Pvt.) Ltd (Consortium) did not fulfill the requirement for submission of EOI fee in form of pay order / bank draft. Therefore, the Committee considered this consortium as "Ineligible" for further procurement process. A total of three (03) consortiums out of four (04) were eligible for evaluation of their EOIs. Based on the evaluation criteria prepared under SPPRA Rules, given in the EOI document, the committee thoroughly examined and evaluated the EOI documents submitted by the eligible consortiums. The lead firm and associated firm of the consortiums had to secure minimum of 70% score separately for shortlisting and qualification for issuance of RFP. In view of this, the Lead Firm has to secure minimum score of 56 (collectively in technical and financial standing) and the Associated Firm has to secure minimum score of 14 (collectively in technical and financial standing). The list of eligible consortiums and their total scores are given below:

S. No.	Name of Eligible Consortiums	Score (out of 100)
1.	M/s. Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder (EY) associated with Osmani & Company (Pvt.) Ltd. (Consortium)	76.0
2.	M/s. Deloitte Yusuf Adil, associated with Atif Nazar Associates (Consortium)	78.2
3.	M/s. Oxford Policy Management Limited associated with Spectra Engineering Solution (Pvt.) Ltd (Consortium)	71.6

3. Considering the passing score of 70 out of 100, the committee shortlisted and qualified all three (03) eligible consortiums for issuance of Request of Proposal (RFP). The meeting concluded with the vote of thanks to and from the Chair.

00

(Nabesh Akhtar)

Deputy Director (Procurement),

Directorate of UP&SP, P&D Department,

Govt. of Sindh. (Member/ Secretary) (Akbar Ali Brahmani)

River

Deputy Secretary (Dev.II)
Finance Department,
Govt. of Sindh.

(Member)

DIRECTORATE OF URBAN POLICY & STRATEGIC PLANNING PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT, GOVERNMENT OF SINDH

Bungalow No. 37E/2, P.E.C.H.S Block-6, Karachi.

Tel: +92 21 34300555-57 Fax: +92 21 34300554 www.urbandirectorate.gos.pk

ちょ





(Muhammad Saleem Jalbani)

Chief (EPR), P&D Department, Govt. of Sindh. (Member) (Mr. Farooque Ahmed Sidelqui)

Director,

Local Government Department, Govt. of Sindh. (Member)

Mumtaz Ali)

Director Urban Policy & Planning,
Directorate of UP&SP, P&D Department,
Govt. of Sindh.
(Co-opted Member)

(Khair Muhammad Kalwar)

Director General,
Directorate of UP&SP, P&D Department,
Govt. of Sindh.
(Chairman)

CONFIDENTIAL

## SUMMARY EVALUATION SHEET FOR EXPRESSIONS OF INTEREST

## Project Title: Municipal Finance Assessment Study for Sindh

S. No.	Name of Firm	Score	Qualified / Disqualified for Issuance of RFP
1	M/s. Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder (EY) associated with Osmani & Company (Pvt.) Ltd. (Consortium)	76.0	Qualified
2	M's. Deloitte Yusuf Adil, associated with Atif Nazar Associates (Consortium)	78.2	Qualified
3	M/s. Oxford Policy Management Limited associated with Spectra Engineering Solution (Pvt.) Ltd (Consortium)	71.6	Qualified

Note: 70 marks out of 100 have been fixed for Qualification

Evaluated by:

(Nabesh Akhtar)
Deputy Director (Procurement),
Directorate of UP&SP, P&D Department,
Govt. of Sindh.
(Member/ Secretary)

(Muhammad Saleem albani)

Chief (EPR),

P&D Department, Govt. of Sindh (Member)

(Mum sz Aln)

Director - Urban Policy & Planning,
Directorate of UP&SP,

P&D Department, Govt. of Sindh

(Co-opted Member)

(Akbar Ali Brahmani),

Deputy Secretary (Dev.II), Finance Department, Govt. of Sindh (Member)

(Farooque Ahmed Siddiqui)

Director, Local Government Departin

Govt. of Sindh, (Member)

Khair Muhammad Kalwar)

Director General,

Directorate of UP&SP, P&D Department,

Govt. of Sindh.

(Chairman)

# EVALUATION SHEET FOR EXPRESSIONS OF INTEREST (CONSOLIDATED SHEET)

# Project Title: Municipal Finance Assessment Study for Sindh

		S. No.	S. No.	1	2	3
.N	EVALUATION CRITERIA	Max.	Max. Score	M/s. Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder (EY) associated with Osmani & Company (Pvt.) Ltd. (Consortium)	M/s. Deloitte Yusuf Adil, associated with Atif Nazar Associates (Consortium)	M/s. Oxford Policy Management Limits associated with Spec Engineering Solutio (Pvt.) Ltd (Consortio
				Score	Score	Score
1	Technical Standing of Firm	80	80			
١	Project experience	30	30			
1	Experience in Pakistan (Similar nature of contracts executed) Minimum Value	25	25			
	of Consultan cy Rs. 10 million.					
-	Lead Firm - 80%	10	8	8.0	8.0	8.0
-	i. Up to 5 Projects ii. Up to 10 Projects	20		0.0	0.0	0.0
-	iii. More than 10 Projects	25				
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%	-				
Ξ	i. Up to 5 Projects	10			2.0	
	ii. Up to 10 Projects	20		4.0		
	iii. More than 10 Projects	25	5			5.0
0	Experience in International Context (Similar nature of contracts executed) Minimum Value of Consultancy Rs. 20 million	5	5			
	Lead Firm - 80%	2	1.6			0.0
÷	i. Up to 2 Projects ii. Up to 4 Projects	3		2.4	2.4	9,0
-	m. More than 4 Projects	5		5/7		
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					
	i. Up to 2 Projects	2	0.4	• 0.1	0.0	0.0
ī	ii. Up to 4 Projects	3				
	iii. More than 4 Projects	5	1			
	Sub Total - A	-		14.7	12.4	13.0
В	Personnel Experience (Technical Personnel in the permanent Employment	50	50			
	of the Firm(s)/Company)	5	5			
4	No of personnel (Relevant Technical) Lead Firm - 80%	-				
	LUp to 3	1	0.8			
	ii Up to 5	3				
	ii Up to 7	5	4	4.0	4.0	4.0
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					
	1 1/p to 3	1				
	ii Up to 5	3		0.4	1.0	10
	n Up to 7	5	5		1.0	1.0
0	Permanency of Relevant Technical Personal with the Firm(s) Lead Firm - 80%	- 3	2			
	For each year/professional (years x 0.25)	5	4	4.0	4.0	4.0
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					
	i. For each year/professional (years x 0.25)	- 5	1	1.0	1.0	1.0
c	Relevant Experience	25	25			
	Lead Firm - 80%					
_	i. For each year/professional (years x 0.5)	25	20	20.0	20.0	20,0
-	Associated Firm(s) - 20%	25		5.0	5.0	5.0
4	i. For each year/professional (years x 0.5)  Qualification	15	15	5.0	3.0	3.0
4	Lead Firm - 80%	1.7	12			
	i) Each Professional with relevant Bachelors Degree	0.70	0.56	3.2	6.3	1.8
	ii) Each Professional with relevant Postgraduate Diploma	0.80		0.8		0.0
I	iii) Each professional with relevant Postgraduate Degree	0.90	0.72	1.6	2.3	3.6
	iv) Each Professional with relevant Doctorate Degree	1.0		0.0		
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%		3	0.2	1.0	10
_	i) Each Professional with relevant Bachelors Degree	0.7	0.14	0.2	1.0	1.0
-	ii) Each Professional with relevant Postgraduate Diploma iii) Each professional with relevant Postgraduate Degree	0.9		0.5	1.2	1.2
	iv) Each Professional with relevant Postgraduate Degree	1.0		0.2	4.5	
	Sub Total - B			41.3	45.8	42.6
2	Financial Standing / Status of the Firm(s)	20	20			
	Average annual turnover (For the last three years duly certified)					
_	Lead Firm - 80%		16			
	i) Annual turnover of up to Rs. 30 million	5				
_	ii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 30 million and up to 60 million	10		16.0	16.0	16.0
_	iii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 60 million Associated Firm(s) - 20%	20	16	16.0	10.0	10.0
-	Associated Firm(s) - 20%     Annual turnover of up to Rs 10 million	5				
	Annual turnover of up to Rs. 10 million and up to 15 million	10				
	iii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 15 million	20		4.0	4.0	0.0
Ξ	Sub Total - C			20.0	20.0	16.0
_	Total (A+B+C)	_	100	76.0	78.2	71.6
	Qualified / Disqualified	11		Qualified	/ Qualified	Qualified

( P)

 $\psi_{\iota}$ 

Winny

K.

# Project Title: Municipal Finance Assessment Study for Sindh

		534 - 140	S. No. Max.	Mis Frant & Vouna		CONSTRUCTION OF A SECTION OF THE
S.N 0.	EVALUATION CRITERIA	Max. Scor		M/s. Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder (EY) associated with Osmani & Company (Pvt.) Ltd. (Consortium)	M/s. Deloitte Yusuf Adil, associated with Atif Nazar Associates (Consortium)	M/s. Oxford Policy Management Limited associated with Spect Engineering Solution (Pvt.) Ltd (Consortium Score
7	Technical Standing of Firm	80	30	Secto	Secre	Scene
	Project experience	30	77.7			
a	Experience in Pakistan (Similar nature of contracts executed) Minimum Value of Consultan ey Rs. 10 million.	25	25			
	Lead Firm - 80%	2.0			0.0	2.0
_	i. Up to 5 Projects	10		8.0	8.0	8.0
_	ii. Up to 10 Projects iii. More than 10 Projects	25	20			
-	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					
	i. Up to 5 Projects	10	2		2.0	
	ii. Up to 10 Projects	20		4.0		
	iii. More than 10 Projects	25	5			5.0
ь	Experience in International Context (Similar nature of contracts executed) Minimum Value of Consultancy Rs. 20 million. Lead Firm - 80%	5	5			
	1 Up to 2 Projects	2	1.6			0.0
	ii. Up to 4 Projects	3	2.4	2.4	2.4	
	iii. More than 4 Projects	5				
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					
	i. Up to 2 Projects	2		0.0	0.0	0.0
	ii. Up to 4 Projects	3				
_	iii. More than 4 Projects	. 5	- 1	477	15.4	12.0
-	Sub Total - A			14.4	12.4	13.0
В	Personnel Experience (Technical Personnel in the permanent Employment of the Firm(s)/Company) No of personnel (Relevant Technical)	50	<b>50</b>	11/00		
	Lead Firm - 80%					
	r. Up to 3	- 1	0.8			
	ii. Up to 5	3				
	ii. Up to 7	- 5	4	4,0	4.0	4.0
_	Associated Firm(s) - 20%	-				
_	i. Up to 3	3		0.6		
	ii. Up to 5 ii. Up to 7	5		0.6	1.0	1.0
ь	Permanency of Relevant Technical Personal with the Firm(s)	5	5		1.9	1.0
	Lead Firm - 80%					
	i. For each year/professional (years x 0.25)	5	4	4.0	4.0	4.0
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%			19197		4.0
_	i. For each year/professional (years x 0.25)	5		1.0	1,0	1.0
C	Relevant Experience Lead Firm - 80%	25	25			
-	i For each year/professional (years x 0.5)	25	20	20.0	20.0	20.0
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					
	i. For each year/professional (years x 0.5)	25	5	5.0	5.0	5.0
d	Qualification	15	15			
	Lead Firm - 80%		12			
	i) Each Professional with relevant Bachelors Degree	0.70	0.56	2.8	5.6	1.7
_	ii) Each Professional with relevant Postgraduate Diploma iii) Each professional with relevant Postgraduate Degree	0.90	0.72	1.4	2.2	3.6
_	iv) Each Professional with relevant Postgraduate Degree iv) Each Professional with relevant Doctorate Degree	1.0		0.0	**	3.0
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%		3			
	i) Each Professional with relevant Bachelors Degree	0.7	0.14	0.1	1.0	1.0
	ii) Each Professional with relevant Postgraduate Diploma	0.8				
	iii) Each professional with relevant Postgraduate Degree	0.9		0.4	1.3	11
	iv) Each Professional with relevant Doctorate Degree	1.0	0.2	0.2	47.5	
_	Sub Total - B		20	40,2	45.0	42.3
	Financial Standing / Status of the Firm(s)	20	20			
a	Average annual turnover (For the last three years duly certified)  Lead Firm - 80%		16			<del>                                     </del>
	i) Annual turnover of up to Rs. 30 million	5				
	ii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 30 million and up to 60 million	10				
	iii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 60 million	20	16	16.0	16.0	16.0
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%		4			
	i) Annual turnover of up to Rs. 10 million	5				
_	ii) Annual turnover of more than Rs 10 million and up to 15 million	10		4.0	4.0	0.0
_	iii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 15 million	20	4	4.0 20.0	20.0	16.0
_	Sub Total - C			20.0	20.0	10.0
	Total Control of the	100	100	74.6	77.4	71.3
	Total (A+B+C)					

EVALUATED BY:

(Khair Muhammad Kalwar), Director General, Directorate of UP&SP, P&D Department, Govt. of Sindh (Chairman)

# Project Title: Municipal Finance Assessment Study for Sindh

		S. No.	S. No.	1	2	3
0.		Max.	Max. Score	M/s. Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder (EY) associated with Osmani & Company (Pvt.) Ltd. (Consortium)	M/s. Deloitte Yusuf Adil, associated with Atif Nazar Associates (Consortium)	M/s. Oxford Policy Management Limited associated with Spectr Engineering Solution (Pvt.) Ltd (Consortium
_				Score	Score	Score
1	Technical Standing of Firm	80	80			
١	Project experience	30	30			
a	Experience in Pakistan (Similar nature of contracts executed) Minimum Value of Consultan cy Rs. 10 million.	25	25			
_	Lead Firm - 80%	4.0	-	2.0	0.0	9.Λ
_	i. Up to 5 Projects	10		8.0	8.0	8.0
-	ii Up to 10 Projects	20				
_	iii More than 10 Projects	25	20			
-	Associated Firm(s) - 20%	10	2		2.0	
_	i. Up to 5 Projects ii. Up to 10 Projects	20		4.0	- 4	
-	iii. More than 10 Projects	25		7.0		5.0
-	Experience in International Context (Similar nature of contracts executed)					
Ь.	Minimum Value of Consultancy Rs. 20 million.  Lead Firm - 80%	5	5			
-	i. Up to 2 Projects	2	1.6			0.0
-	ii. Up to 4 Projects	3		2.4	2.4	
-	iii. More than 4 Projects	5				
-	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					
_	1. Up to 2 Projects	2	0.4		0.0	0.0
_	ii. Up to 4 Projects	3		0.6		
T	iii. More than 4 Projects	5	1			
	Sub Total - A			15.0	12.4	13.0
В	Personnel Experience (Technical Personnel in the permanent Employment of the Firm(s)/Company)	50	50	•		
a	No of personnel (Relevant Technical)	5	5			
	Lead Firm - 80%					
	i. Up to 3	1				
	ii Up to 5	3				
	ii. Up to 7	5	4	4.0	4.0	4.0
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					
	i. Up to 3	1				
	II. Up to 5	3			1.0	1.0
-	ii. Up to 7	5		1.0	1.0	1.0
b	- 129 PARTER PARTE 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	5	5			
-	Lead Firm - 80% 1. For each year/professional (years x 0 25)	5	4	4.0	4.0	4.0
-	Associated Firm(s) - 20%	-	1	7.9		
-	For each year/professional (years x 0.25)	5	1	1.0	1.0	1.0
c	Relevant Experience	25	25			
-	Lead Firm - 80%					
_	For each year/professional (years x 0.5)	25	20	20.0	20.0	20.0
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					
	i. For each year/professional (years x 0.5)	25		5.0	5.0	5.0
d	Qualification	15	15			
	Lead Firm - 80%		12			
	i) Each Professional with relevant Bachelors Degree	0.70		3.4	6.7	1.7
_	ii) Each Professional with relevant Postgraduate Diploma	0.80		1.3	2.2	2.6
_	iii) Each professional with relevant Postgraduate Degree	0.90		1.4	2.2	3.6
	iv) Each Professional with relevant Doctorate Degree	1.0	0.8	0.0		
-	Associated Firm(s) - 20% i) Each Professional with relevant Bachelors Degree	0.7		0.1	1.0	1.1
-	Each Professional with relevant Bachelors Degree     Bach Professional with relevant Postgraduate Diploma	0.8		0.2	1.0	
-	iii) Each Professional with relevant Postgraduate Diploma iii) Each professional with relevant Postgraduate Degree	0.9		0.4	1.4	1.3
	iv) Each Professional with relevant Postgraduate Degree	1.0		0.2	*1.1	
	Sub Total - B	-	-	42.0	46.3	42.7
2	Financial Standing / Status of the Firm(s)	20	20			
	Average annual turnover (For the last three years duly certified)					
	Lead Firm - 80%		16			
	i) Annual turnover of up to Rs. 30 million	5				
	ii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 30 million and up to 60 million	10				
	iii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 60 million	20		16.0	16.0	16.0
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%		4			
	i) Annual turnover of up to Rs. 10 million	5				
	ii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 10 million and up to 15 million	10		40	4.0	0.0
	iii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 15 million	20	4	20.0	20.0	16.0
_				40.0	20.0	10.0
_	Sub Total - C	-				
_	Sub Iotal - C		100	77.0	78.7	71.7

EVALUATED BY:

(Farooque Ahmed Siddiqui)
Director, Local Government Department,
Govt. of Sindh,
(Member)

# Project Title: Municipal Finance Assessment Study for Sindh

		S. No.	S. No. Max.	i	3	3
S.N 0.	EVALUATION CRITERIA	Max. Scor	Score	M/s. Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder (EY) associated with Osmani & Company (Pvt.) Ltd. (Consortium)	M/s. Deloitte Yusuf Adil, associated with Atif Nazar Associates (Consortium)	M/s. Oxford Policy Management Limited associated with Spectri Engineering Solution (Pvt.) Ltd (Consortium Score
1	Technical Standing of Firm	80	80	3437		
-	Project experience	30				
a	Experience in Pakistan (Similar nature of contracts executed) Minimum Value of Consultan cy Rs. 10 million.	-	25			
	Lend Firm - 80%	1.0		0.0	8.0	8.0
-	i Up to 5 Projects	20		8.0	5.0	3.0
-	ii. Up to 10 Projects iii. More than 10 Projects	25				
-	Associated Firm(s) - 20%		40			
-	LUp to 5 Projects	10	2		2.0	
	ii. Up to 10 Projects	20		4.0		
	iii. More than 10 Projects	25	5			5.0
ъ	Experience in International Context (Similar nature of contracts executed) Minimum Value of Consultancy Rs. 20 million.  Lead Firm - 80%	5	5			
	1. Up to 2 Projects	2	1.6			0.0
	ii. Up to 4 Projects	3	2.4	2.4	2,4	
	iii. More than 4 Projects	5	4			
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					0.0
	i. Up to 2 Projects	2		0.4	0.0	0.0
	ii. Up to 4 Projects	3				
_	iii More than 4 Projects	- 5	1	• 110	12.4	13.0
-	Sub Total - A		20.00	14.8	14.4	15.0
В	Personnel Experience (Technical Personnel in the permanent Employment of the Firm(s)/Company)	50	50			
	No of personnel (Relevant Technical)	5	5			
	Lead Firm - 80%	Ť				THE PERSON NAMED IN
	i. Up to 3	1	0.8			
	ii. Up to 5	3	2.4			
	ii. Up to 7	5	4	4.0	4.0	4.0
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					
	i. Up to 3	1				
	ii. Up to 5	3		1.0	1.0	1.0
1	ii. Up to 7	5		1.0	1.0	1.0
ь	Permanency of Relevant Technical Personal with the Firm(s)  Lead Firm - 80%	5	5			
_	i For each year/professional (years x 0.25)	5	4	4.0	4.0	4.0
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					
	For each year/professional (years x 0.25)	- 5	- 1	1.0	1.0	1.0
c	Relevant Experience	25	25			
	Lead Firm - 80%					
	i. For each year/professional (years x 0.5)	25	20	20.0	20.0	20.0
_	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					
٠.	i. For each year/professional (years x 0.5)	25	5	5.0	5.0	5.0
d	Qualification	15	15			
-	Lead Firm - 80%  i) Each Professional with relevant Bachelors Degree	0.70		3.4	6.2	2.2
	ii) Each Professional with relevant Bachelors Degree	0.80		0.6	77) #	
	iii) Each professional with relevant Postgraduate Degree	0.90	0.72	1.4	2.9	3.6
	iv) Each Professional with relevant Doctorate Degree	1.0	0.8	0.0		
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%		3			
	i) Each Professional with relevant Bachelors Degree	0.7	0.14	0.3	1.0	0.1
	ii) Each Professional with relevant Postgraduate Diploma	0.8	0.16	0.2	0.0	
_	iii) Each professional with relevant Postgraduate Degree	1.0	0.18	0.6	0,9	1.3
-	iv) Each Professional with relevant Doctorate Degree	_	0.2	41.7	45.9	43.1
-	Sub Total - B	20	20	41.7	43.3	43.1
	Financial Standing / Status of the Firm(s)  Average annual turnover (For the last three years duly certified)	-0	20	37		
-	Lead Firm - 80%		16			
	i) Annual turnover of up to Rs. 30 million	- 5				
	ii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 30 million and up to 60 million iii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 60 million	10	16	16.0	16.0	16.0
-	Associated Firm(s) - 20% i) Annual turnover of up to Rs. 10 million	- 5	4			
-	Annual turnover of up to Rs. 10 million     Annual turnover of more than Rs. 10 million and up to 15 million	10				
-	ii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 10 million and up to 13 million	20		4.0	4.0	0.0
	Sub Total - C	_	7	20.0	20.0	16.0
	Jotal (A+B+C	100	100	76.5	78.3	72.1

(Muhammad Saleem Jalbani) Chief (EPR). P&D Department, Govt. of Sindh (Member)

# Project Title: Municipal Finance Assessment Study for Sindh

		e v.	S. No.			- 3
S.N 0.	EVALUATION CRITERIA	Max.	Max. Score	M/s. Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder (EY) associated with Osmani & Company (Pvt.) Ltd. (Consortium)	M/s. Deloitte Yusuf Adil, associated with Atif Nazar Associates (Consortium)	M/s. Oxford Policy Management Limite associated with Spect Engineering Solutio (Pvt.) Ltd (Consortiu
	AND AND THE CONTROL OF THE CONTROL O			Score	Score	Score
1	Technical Standing of Firm	80	80			
A	Project experience	30	30			
	Experience in Pakistan (Similar nature of contracts executed) Minimum Value of Consultan cy Rs. 10 million.	25	25			
	Lead Firm - 80%					
	i. Up to 5 Projects	10		8.0	8.0	8.0
	ii. Up to 10 Projects	20	16			
	iii More than 10 Projects	25	20			
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%	10	2		2.0	
	i. Up to 5 Projects ii. Up to 10 Projects	20		4.0	Apr.) (f	
	iii. More than 10 Projects	25	5	4.0		5.0
	Experience in International Context (Similar nature of contracts executed) Minimum Value of Consultancy Rs. 20 million.	5	5			
-	Lead Firm - 80%	-	1.6			0.0
	i Up to 2 Projects	2		2.4	2.4	0.0
-	ii. Up to 4 Projects	5		2,4	4.4	
-	iii, More than 4 Projects	3	-			
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%	2	0.4		0.0	0.0
	i Up to 2 Projects	3		0.6	V.V	0.0
	ii Up to 4 Projects iii More than 4 Projects	5		0.0		
-	Sub Total - A	-	-	15.0	12.4	13.0
	Personnel Experience (Technical Personnel in the permanent Employment			•		
В	of the Firm(s)/Company)	50	50			
a	No of personnel (Relevant Technical)	5	5			
	Lead Firm - 80%	-				
	i. Up to 3	1	0.8			
	11. Up to 5	3	2.4			
	11. Up to 7	5	4	4.0	4.0	4.0
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					
	ı Up to 3	- 1				
	ii. Up to 5	3		0.6		
	n Up to 7	5			1.0	1.0
ь	Permanency of Relevant Technical Personal with the Firm(s)	5	5			
_	Lead Firm - 80%	-			4.0	4.0
_	i. For each year/professional (years x 0.25)	5	4	4.0	4.0	4.0
_	Associated Firm(s) - 20%	5	- ,	1.0	1.0	1.0
	i. For each year/professional (years x 0.25) Relevant Experience	25	25	1.0	1.0	1.0
·	Lead Firm - 80%		20			
	i. For each year/professional (years x 0.5)	25	20	20.0	20.0	20.0
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%	-				
П	i. For each year/professional (years x 0.5)	25	5	5.0	5.0	5.0
d	Qualification	15	15			
	Lead Firm - 80%		12	-50		
	1) Each Professional with relevant Bachelors Degree	0.70	0.56	3.4	6.2	1,7
	ii) Each Professional with relevant Postgraduate Diploma	0.80	0.64	0.6		
	iii) Each professional with relevant Postgraduate Degree	0.90		2.2	2.2	3.6
	iv) Each Professional with relevant Doctorate Degree	1.0		0.0		
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%	0.5	3	Δ1	1.0	1.0
	i) Each Professional with relevant Bachelors Degree	0.7	0.14	0.1	1.0	1.0
	ii) Each Professional with relevant Postgraduate Diploma	0.8		0.2	1.3	1.3
-	iii) Each professional with relevant Postgraduate Degree	1.0		0.6	1.3	1.3
	iv) Each Professional with relevant Doctorate Degree  Sub Total - B		9.2	41.8	45.6	42.5
2	Financial Standing / Status of the Firm(s)	20	20	41.0	45.0	74.0
	Average annual turnover (For the last three years duly certified)	20	20			
4	Lead Firm - 80%		16			
	i) Annual turnover of up to Rs. 30 million	5				
	ii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 30 million and up to 60 million	10				
	iii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 60 million	20		16.0	16.0	16.0
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%		4			
	i) Annual turnover of up to Rs. 10 million	5				
	ii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 10 million and up to 15 million	10				
	iii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 15 million	20	- 4	4.0	4.0	0.0
	Sub Total - C			20.0	20.0	16.0
						- DENIG
_		100	100	76.8	78.0	71.5
	Total (A+B+C)	100	100	70.0	Qualified	Qualified

EVALUATED BY:

Melur

(Akbar Ali Brahmani), Deputy Secretary (Dev.II), Finance Department, Govt. of Sindh (Member)

# Project Title: Municipal Finance Assessment Study for Sindh

			2 4			1
N	EVALUATION CRITERIA	Max.	S. No. Max. Score with Weight age (80%	M/s. Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder (EY) associated with Osmani & Company (Pvt.) Ltd. (Consortium)	M/s. Deloitte Yusuf Adil, associated with Atif Nazar Associates (Consortium)	M/s. Oxford Policy Management Limited associated with Spectr Engineering Solution (Pvt.) Ltd (Consortium
				Score	Score	Score
	Fechnical Standing of Firm	80	80			
	Project experience	30	30			
	Experience in Pakistan (Similar nature of contracts executed) Minimum Value of Consultan cy Rs. 10 million.	25	25			
	Lead Firm - 80%	10	8	8.0	8.0	8.0
	Up to 5 Projects Up to 10 Projects	20	16	9.9	3.0	0.0
	iii. More than 10 Projects	25	20			
_	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					
	Up to 5 Projects	10			2.0	
	LUp to 10 Projects	20		4.0		
	ii. More than 10 Projects	25	. 5			5.0
	Experience in International Context (Similar nature of contracts executed)  Minimum Value of Consultancy Rs. 20 million.  Lead Firm - 80%	5	5			
_	Lead Firm - 50%	2	1.6			0.0
	i. Up to 4 Projects	3		2.4	2.4	
	iii. More than 4 Projects	5				
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					
	Up to 2 Projects	2		0.0	0.0	0.0
	Up to 4 Projects	3				
	ii. More than 4 Projects	5	1		127	12.0
4	Sub Total - A			14.4	12.4	13.0
	Personnel Experience (Technical Personnel in the permanent Employment	50	50			
	of the Firm(s)/Company)	5	5			
	No of personnel (Relevant Technical) Lead Firm - 80%	-	- 1			
	LUp to 3	- 1	0.8			
	ii. Up to 5	3				
	ii. Up to 7	5	4	4.0	4.0	4.0
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					
	i. Up to 3	1				
	ii. Up to 5	3		0.6		1.0
	ii. Up to 7	5			1.0	1.0
2	Permanency of Relevant Technical Personal with the Firm(s)	- 5	5			
-	Lead Firm - 80% i. For each year/professional (years x 0.25)	5	4	4.0	4.0	4.0
+	Associated Firm(s) - 20%				3.50.40	
	i. For each year/professional (years x 0.25)	5	1	1.0	1.0	1.0
	Relevant Experience	25	25			
	Lead Firm - 80%					
	i. For each year/professional (years x 0.5)	25	20	20.0	20.0	20.0
_	Associated Firm(s) - 20%					
	i. For each year/professional (years x 0.5)	25		5.0	5.0	5.0
1	Qualification	15	15			
- U	Lead Firm - 80%	0.70		3.4	6.7	1.7
-	i) Each Professional with relevant Bachelors Degree ii) Each Professional with relevant Postgraduate Diploma	0.80		0.6		*177
	ii) Each professional with relevant Postgraduate Diploma	0.90		1.4	2.2	3.6
	iv) Each Professional with relevant Doctorate Degree	1.0		0.0		
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%		3			
	i) Each Professional with relevant Bachelors Degree	0.7		0.1	1.0	1.0
	ii) Each Professional with relevant Postgraduate Diploma	0.8				1.2
_	iii) Each professional with relevant Postgraduate Degree	0.9		0.4	1.3	1.3
	iv) Each Professional with relevant Doctorate Degree	1.0	0.2	0.2 40.9	46.1	42.5
,	Sub Total - B	20	20	40.7	70.1	74.0
	Financial Standing / Status of the Firm(s)  Average annual turnover (For the last three years duly certified)	20				
4	Lead Firm - 80%		16			1111111
	i) Annual turnover of up to Rs. 30 million	5	4			
	ii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 30 million and up to 60 million	10				
	iii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 60 million	20		16.0	16.0	16.0
	Associated Firm(s) - 20%	-	4			
	i) Annual turnover of up to Rs. 10 million	5				
	ii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 10 million and up to 15 million	10			4.0	0.0
-	iii) Annual turnover of more than Rs. 15 million	20	4	20.0	20.0	16.0
	C.L. T. C.					
	Sub Total - C			20.0	- Takkin	1315
	Sub Total - C Total (A+B+C		100	75.3	78.5	71.5

EVALUATED BY:

(Nabesh Akhtar), Deputy Director (Procurement), Directorate of UP&SP, P&D Department, Govt. of Sindh (Member/ Secretary)

## Project Title: Municipal Finance Assessment Study for Sindh

S.N 0.	EVALUATION CRITERIA	Max.	S. No. Max. Score with Weight age (80% and	M/s. Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder (EY) associated with Osmani & Company (Pvt.) Ltd. (Consortium)	M/s. Deloitte Yusuf Adil, associated with Atif Nazar Associates (Consortium)	M/s. Oxford Policy Management Limited associated with Spectr Engineering Solution (Pvt.) Ltd (Consortium
1 To	echnical Standing of Firm	80	80	Score	Score	Score
_	oject experience	30				
Ex	perience in Pakistan (Similar nature of contracts executed) Minimum Value Consultan cy Rs. 10 million	25	25			
170-010	ad Firm - 80%					
	Up to 5 Projects	10	8	8.0	8.0	8.0
	Up to 10 Projects  More than 10 Projects	20	16			
	sociated Firm(s) - 20%	44	20			
	Jp to 5 Projects	10	2		2.0	
	Up to 10 Projects	20	4	4.0		
	More than 10 Projects	25	5			5.0
Mi	perience in International Context (Similar nature of contracts executed) nimum Value of Consultancy Rs 20 million. ad Firm - 80%	5	5			
	Jp to 2 Projects	2	1.6			0.0
	Up to 4 Projects	3	2.4	2.4	2.4	
	More than 4 Projects	5	4			
Ass	sociated Firm(s) - 20%					
	Jp to 2 Projects	2	0.4	0.0	0.0	0.0
	Up to 4 Projects	- 3	0.6			
111	More than 4 Projects	5	- 1			12.0
n.	Sub Total - A			14.4	12.4	13.0
of	rsonnel Experience (Technical Personnel in the permanent Employment the Firm(s)/Company) of personnel (Relevant Technical)	50	50			
	ad Firm - 80%					
i. U	Up to 3	1	0.8			
	Up to 5	3	2.4			
	Up to 7	5	4	4.0	4.0	4.0
	sociated Firm(s) - 20%					
	Jp to 3 Up to 5	3	0.2	0.6		
	Up to 7	5	1	0.0	1.0	1.0
b Per	rmanency of Relevant Technical Personal with the Firm(s) ad Firm - 80%	5	5			1.00
i. F	For each year/professional (years x 0.25) sociated Firm(s) - 20%	5	4	4.0	4 0	4.0
	For each year/professional (years x 0.25)	. 5	- 1	1.0	1.0	1.0
	levant Experience	25	25			
	ad Firm - 80%					
	For each year/professional (years x 0.5) sociated Firm(s) - 20%	25	20	20.0	20.0	20.0
	For each year/professional (years x 0.5)	25	5	5.0	5.0	5.0
	alification	15	15			
	ad Firm - 80%		12			
	Each Professional with relevant Bachelors Degree	0.70	0.56	3.4	6.7	1.7
	Each Professional with relevant Postgraduate Diploma	0.80	0.64	0.6	2.2	2.6
	Each Professional with relevant Postgraduate Degree  Each Professional with relevant Doctorate Degree	0.90	0.72	0.0	2.2	3.6
	sociated Firm(s) - 20%	1.0	3	4.4		
	Each Professional with relevant Bachelors Degree	0.7	0.14	0.1	1.0	1.0
	Each Professional with relevant Postgraduate Diploma	0.8	0.16	0.2		
iii)	Each professional with relevant Postgraduate Degree	0.9	0.18	0.4	1.3	1.3
11/	Each Professional with relevant Doctorate Degree	1.0	0.2	0.2		
	Sub Total - B		20	40.9	46.1	42.5
	nancial Standing / Status of the Firm(s)	20	20			
	verage annual turnover (For the last three years duly certified)		16			
111111	Annual turnover of up to Rs. 30 million	5	4			
11)	Annual turnover of more than Rs. 30 million and up to 60 million	10	8			
111)	Annual turnover of more than Rs. 60 million	20	16	16.0	16.0	16.0
As	sociated Firm(s) - 20%		4			
	Annual turnover of up to Rs. 10 million	5	1			
	Annual turnover of more than Rs. 10 million and up to 15 million	10	2	4.0	4.0	0.0
111)	) Annual turnover of more than Rs 15 million  Sub Total - C	_	4	20.0	20.0	16.0
	Sub Iotal - C Total (A+B+C)		100	75.3	78.5	71.5
			100	Qualified	Qualified	Qualified
	Qualified / Disqualified			Quanned	Quanned	Quanned

EVALUATED BY:

(Mumpiz Ali)
Director - Urban Holicy & Planning,
Directorate of UP&SP,
P&D Department, Govt. of Sindh
(Co-opted Member)