# VINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COMPLAINT REDRESSAL COMMITTEE (CRC) HELD ON 21-09-2023 UNDER THE CHAIRMANSHIP OF CHIEF ENGINEER (DEV.). KDA.

Meeting of the Complaint Redressal Committee (CRC) was held on 21-09-2023 under the Chairmanship of Chief Engineer (Dev.), KDA, in his office, to address the grievances of Bidders for the work namely "Construction & Rehabilitation along-with Drainage System, Footpath, Services Roads, Bara Board to Golimar Interchange, District West, Karachi (ADP # 2306 of 2022-23)" /

The following members of the committee attended the meeting:

- 1. Mr. Nadeem Iqbal, Chief Engineer (Dev.), KDA
- 2. Mr. Naveed Izhar, Ex-Chief Engineer, KDA
- 3. Mr. Aziz Mustafa Shaikh, Accounts Officer, AG Sindh.

Chairman, CRC External Member, CRC Member, CRC

The following contractors also attended the meeting:

- 1. M/s. Watan Dost Construction Company
- 2. M/s. Haji Abdul Aziz Khan
- 3. M/s. B.F. Enterprises
- 4. M/s. Pir Hasnain Enterprises
- 5. M/s. Shahzad Yousuf Zai

#### Introduction:

RA

It was informed by the Procurement Committee to the CRC that after completing all codal formalities, the tender of the above said work was opened on 31.08.2023 in the presence of Procurement Committee and Bidders through their representative persons. The Procurement Committee evaluated Financial Proposals in a manner already prescribed in NIT. After thorough evaluation, the complete Bid Evaluation Report was communicated to all the bidders.

#### 1. Discussion for M/s. Watan Dost Construction Company:

M/s. Watan Dost Construction Company complaining about the atrocious tempering and changing the announced rates of the subject by the members of Procurement Committee. However, after detailed scrutiny of bidding documents, no tempering is found in any of the documents, hence the allegations of the complainant do not hold ground.

#### <u>Discussion for M/s. Haji Abdul Aziz Khan</u>

M/s. Haji Abdul Aziz Khan complaining about the forgery and change of quoted values of all participants to illegally award the tender. However, after detailed scrutiny of bidding documents, no forgery and changing of quoted values are found in any of the documents, hence the allegations of the complainant do not hold ground.

#### 3. Discussion for M/s. B.F. Enterprises

M/s. B.F. Enterprises complaining that work was awarded to the bidder at Serial No. 6, which is unjustified and requested for re-scrutiny of tender documents. However, after scrutiny of bidding documents, it is found that the rates quoted by the complainant tied with other bidder, hence not recommended for award of work.

### 4. Discussion for M/s. Pir Hasnain Enterprises

M/s. Pir Hasnain Enterprises complaining that work was awarded to the bidder at Serial No. 6, which is unjustified and requested for re-scrutiny of tender documents. After scrutiny of bidding documents, it is found that the rates quoted by the complainant tied with other bidder, hence not recommended for award of work.

## 5. Discussion for M/s. Shahzad Yousuf Zai

M/s. Shahzad Yousuf Zai complaining about the forgery and change of quoted values of all participants to illegally award the tender. However, after scrutiny of bidding documents, no forgery and changing of quoted values are found in any of the tender documents, hence allegations of the complainant are baseless.

## Decision of the Complaint Redressal Committee (CRC):

The Chief Engineer (Dev.), KDA / Chairman, CRC, examined the entire procurement process and after deliberation / discussion at full length, it was concluded that there are not sufficient grounds to establish any violation of SPP Rules during the process of Procurement. Furthermore, the CRC was of the view that the process / procedure adopted by the Procurement Committee are in accordance to the set procedure & law and in the light of SPPRA Guidelines. Therefore, Procurement Committee is allowed to proceed further and complete the process accordingly.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks from the chair.

Aziz Mustafa Shaikh (Member, CRC)

## **Copy for Information:**

- 1. Managing Director, SPPRA
  - 2. Chairman, Procurement Committee
  - 3. PS to Director-General, KDA
  - 4. All Complainants / Participants Bidder
  - 5. Office Record File

Naveed Izhar (Member, CRC)

Nadeem Iqbal (Chairman, CRC)