

CENTRAL PURCHASE COMMITTEE

PEOPLE'S UNIVERSITY OF MEDICAL & HEALTH SCIENCES FOR WOMEN NAWABSHAH, SHAHEED BENAZIRABAD

PMC Hospital Road, Nawabshah (Shaheed Benazirabad), Sindh, Pakistan

Tel. (Direct): 0092-244-9370519

Tel. (Extension): 0092-244-9370249-58 (2214) Fax: 0092-244-9370263 E-mail: Director.Finance@pumhs.edu.pk

Website: www.pumhs.edu.pk

Dated: 02 / 10 / 2019

No. PUMHSW/SBA /CPC/PROC:/ 095

SAY NO TO CORRUPTION

The Managing Director, Sindh Public Procurement Regulatory Authority, Karachi.

MINUTES OF C.R.C. MEETING SUBJECT:

References:

A. NIT No: PUMHSW / SBA / CPC / Proc. / 221, Dated: March 30th, 2019.

SPPRA T00566-18-0007 on 01-04-19 & Dawn, Jung and Kawish (31-03-19). B.

C. Bid Evaluation Report Hoisted on SPPRA-PPMS site on 27-08-19.

D. Request Letter of M/s Global Marketing System, Karachi, Dt. 28-08-19.

Dear Sir,

In compliance of SPPRA Rule-31, the meeting of CRC was held on September 12, 2019 for the Procurement of Medical & Laboratory Equipment. Kindly find enclosed herewith the minutes of C.R.C. meeting against the tender and Bid Evaluation Report as captioned at 'B' & 'C' for kind record and necessary further action.

Regards,

Pro-Vice Chancellor & Chairman,

Central Purchase Committee PUMHSW, Shaheed Benazirabad

Copy for information & necessary action to:

- 1. All members of Central Purchase Committee, PUMHSW Nawabshah (SBA).
- 2. All members of Technical Committee.
- 3. M/s Global Marketing Systems, Karachi.
- 4. Concerned Office.



MINUTES OF MEETING COMPLAINT REDRESSAL COMMITTEE FOR LABORATORY EQUIPMENT



COMPLAINT REDRESSAL COMMITTEE PEOPLE'S UNIVERSITY OF MEDICAL & HEALTH SCIENCES FOR WOMEN, SHAHEED BENAZIRABA

SUBJECT:

MINUTES OF THE COMPLAINT REDRESSAL COMMITTEE MEETING FOR THE PROCUREMENT OF MEDICAL & LABORATORY EQUIPMENT.

Reference:

- **A. NIT No:** PUMHSW / SBA / CPC / Proc. / 221, **Dated:** March 30th, 2019.
- **B. SPPRA** T00566-18-0007 on 01-04-19 & Dawn, Jung and Kawish (31-03-19).
- **C.** Bid Evaluation Report Hoisted on SPPRA-PPMS site on 27-08-19.
- **D.** Request Letter of M/s Global Marketing System, Karachi, Dt. 28-08-19.

With reference to letter received from M/s Global Marketing System captioned at 'D', the meeting of Complaint Redressal Committee was called by M/s Global Marketing System, in light of SPPRA Rule-31. The meeting was held under Chairmanship of Worthy Vice Chancellor (Chairman, Complain Redressal Committee) on September 12th 2019 at 01:00 pm in the committee room of Vice Chancellor's Secretariat. The following attended the meeting in addition to CRC, to properly redress the grievances of the vendor:

Sr. #	NAME	DESIGNATION	
01	Prof. Dr. Gulshan Ali Memon	Chairman,	
01	Vice Chancellor, PUMHSW	Complaint Redressal Committee	
02	Prof. Dr. Shamsuddin Shaikh	Chairman,	
02	Pro-Vice Chancellor, PUMHSW	Central Purchase Committee	
0.2	Prof. Dr. Muhammad Saleh Khaskheli	Chairman,	
03	Registrar, PUMHS	Technical Committee	
04	Mr. Roshan Ali Sial	Member,	
04	Director Finance, SBBU	Complaint Redressal Committee	
05	Mr. Habib-ur-Rehman	Member,	
05	District Accounts Officer, SBA	Complaint Redressal Committee	
06	Mr. Qari Muhammad Umar	Special Invitee	
00	Prof. Dr. Shamsuddin Shaikh Pro-Vice Chancellor, PUMHSW Central Purchase Com Prof. Dr. Muhammad Saleh Khaskheli Registrar, PUMHS Technical Committee Mr. Roshan Ali Sial Director Finance, SBBU Member, Complaint Redressal Compla	Special Invited	
07	Mr. Asfand Ali Khuhro	Purchase Officer, PUMHSW	
00	Mr. Syed Muhammad Irfan-ul-Haq	M/s Global Marketing System,	
08	Associate Director, Leica GMS	Karachi	
00	Mr. Adil Fazal Shaikh	M/s Global Marketing System,	
09	Assistant Manager Sales	Karachi	

The meeting was started with recitation of few verses from the Holy Quran by Prof. Dr. Muhammad Saleh Khasekheli. Accordingly, the Chairman welcomed the committee members and the bidders. Then after as per agenda, the Chair invited Mr. Syed Muhammad Irfan-ul-Haq from M/s Global Marketing Systems to express his view point. He narrated following points which are summarized as under:

- 1. The Company had submitted its bid via single stage-two envelop (Technical & Financial Proposal).
- 2. The technical proposal was qualified however the financial proposal was rejected because the bid was quoted in two currencies. The same was written as "Conditional Bid" in comparative statement and interestingly the term 'Conditional' is un-defined in SPPRA Rules.
- 3. The company, M/s Global Marketing System, has vast business experience in the supply of similar kind of products to wide range of national and multi-national companies, they always submitted their bid in same pattern for the liberty of Procuring Agency.
- 4. Moreover, the two currencies were given with respect to condition given in bid document. In last, Mr. S. M. Irfan-ul-haq thanked the committee for giving chance to hear and hope for fair decision.

Then, the Committee had given the chance to procurement department to respond against the grievances, which are narrated below:

1. The Purchase Officer informed the CRC Committee that total thirteen bids were sold, out of which twelve firms had submitted their bids, all firms were technically qualified and their financial bids were opened on 13-07-2019. It was observed that M/s Global Marketing System, Khi

(The Complainant Firm) and other three firms had quoted conditional bids i.e. given prices in two currencies against each item. The same was discussed with SPPRA Team for expert opinion. They opined that "as per book, the bids are conditional". Thus, the financial bids of the four firms were rejected, due to same practice.

- 2. The Complainant Firm also stated that they quoted rates as per clause 9 and 10 mentioned in bid document. The instructions at clause 9 & 10 of tender document were given to help bidder to quote price and currency respectively. More importantly, the Instruction 10.2 clearly stated that "Price shall be quoted in foreign currency for goods offered outside the Procuring Agency's country on C&F Basis".
- 3. Hence, the action taken is completely according to procedures as laid down in SPPRA Rules & Regulations in practice at this University.

After discussion and careful listening to the vendor and procurement department, the committee concluded the meeting as follows:

- The miscommunication was occurred because of bid document and grievance of M/s Global Marketing System is valid. Therefore, the Bid Evaluation Report is considered cancel and revised Bid Evaluation Report shall be prepared.
- 2. The University Central Purchase Committee was advised to re-consider financial proposals of all four rejected firms for bid evaluation i.e. M/s Global Marketing System, M/s Qualitron Corporation, Khi, M/s Qualitron Corporation, Khi (*Alternate Offer*) and M/s Scientific Technical Corporation, Lahore.
- 3. It is worth to mention here that the members of Complain Redressal Committee add their valuable remarks that the conversion rate shall be the same as on financial bid opening date (as mentioned in bid document) and No Escalation shall be admissible on foreign currency exchange rates. However, it is better to take rates quoted in PKR currency.

The meeting was ended with vote of thanks to the chair.

Mr. Roshan Ali Sial

Director Finance, SBBU(SBA)

Mr. Habib-ur-Rehman
District Accounts Officer

Prof. Dr. Gulshan Ali Memon Vice Chancellor, PUMHSW

Copy for the information to:

1. Managing Director, SPPRA Karachi.

- 2. All members of Central Purchase Committee & Technical Evaluation Committee, PUMHSW.
- 3. All Bidders participated in the tender.
- 4. Concerned Office.

DIRECTORATE OF FINANCE

PEOPLE'S UNIVERSITY OF MEDICAL & HEALTH SCIENCES FOR WOMEN SHAHEED BENAZIRABAD

PMC Hospital Road, Nawabshah (Shaheed Benazirabad), Sindh, Pakistan Tel. (Direct): 0092-244-9370519 Tel. (Extension): 0092-244-9370249-58 (2214) Website: www.pumhs.edu.pk

Fax: 0092-244-9370263

E-mail: Director.Finance@pumhs.edu.pk

No. PUMHSW / SBA / DOF / PROC:

Dated: 12 / 09 / 2019 SAY NO TO CORRUPTION

ATTENDANCE SHEET

NIT No: PUMHSW / SBA / CPC / Proc: 221, Dated: 30th-03-2019 SPPRA ID No: T00566-18-0007, Uploaded on: 01-04-2019

The attendance sheet of Complain Redressal Committee for the tender Procurement of Medical & Equipment for PUMHSW. The request for CRC was made by M/s Global Marketing System Karachi, the meeting was held on 12 September 2019 at 01:00 pm in the Conference Hall Room of Vice Chancellor's Secretariat.

Sr. #	NAME & DESIGNATION	DESIGNATION	SIGNATURE
01	Prof. Dr. Gulshan Ali Memon Vice Chancellor, PUMHSW	Chairman, Complaint Redressal Committee	Humas
02	Prof. Dr. Shamsuddin Shaikh Pro-Vice Chancellor, PUMHSW(SBA)	Chairman, Central Purchase Committee	Opmins
03	Mr. Roshan Ali Sial Director Finance, SBBU(SBA)	Member, Complaint Redressal Committee	Alway 123
04	Mr. Habib-ur-Rehman Arain District Treasury / Accounts Officer	Member, Complaint Redressal Committee	Hi.
05	Prof. Dr. Muhammad Saleh Khaskheli Registrar, PUMHSW	Chairman, University Purchase Committee & Technical Committee	
06	Mr. Asfand Ali Khuhro Purchase Officer, PUMHSW	Secretary, Complaint Redressal Committee	CONT.
07	Mr. Syed Muhammad Irfan-ul-Haq Associate Director, Leica GMS	M/s Global Marketing System, Karachi	Rour
08	Mr. Adil Fazal Shaikh Assistant Manager Sales	M/s Global Marketing System, Karachi	Adil
09			
10			(