

**GOVERNMENT OF SINDH
LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING TOWN PLANNING,
RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND PHE DEPARTMENT**

Karachi dated the 20th February, 2015

NOTIFICATION

No.SO(L&C)HTP/LDA/10-33/2015: Pursuant to Rule-67 of the Sindh Public Procurement Rules, 2010 (amended 2013), the Consultant Selection Committee, Lyari Development Authority is hereby constituted with following composition for Hawksbay Elevated Freeway of Lyari Development Authority:-

- | | | |
|----|---|----------------------|
| 1. | Mr.Abdul Aziz Memon, Superintending Engineer (BS-19)
Lyari Development Authority, Karachi. | Chairman |
| 2. | Mr.Sikandar Ali Shaikh, T&C Section/P&D Deptt: | Member |
| 3. | Deputy Secretary (Dev-I), Finance Department. | Member |
| 4. | Deputy Director (F&A), LDA (BS-18) | Member |
| 5. | Executive Engineer (BS-18) concerned LDA | Member/
Secretary |

2. The terms of references (ToRs) shall be followed as enunciated in the Sindh Public Procurement Rules, 2010 (amended 2013).

SECRETARY TO GOVT. OF SINDH

No.SO(L&C)HTP/LDA/10-33/2015:

Karachi dated the 20th February, 2015

A copy is forwarded for information and necessary action to:-

1. The Additional Chief Secretary (Dev.) Planning & Development Department, Karachi.
2. The Secretary, Finance Department, Govt. of Sindh, Karachi.
3. The Director General, Lyari Development Authority, Karachi.
4. All Members Concerned.
5. The P.S to Secretary, Local Govt. Department.
6. Office Order File.


(GHULAM NABI)
SECTION OFFICER (L&C)



LYARI DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY

1ST FLOOR, APOLO CENTRE, ADJACENT TO BEHERIA UNIVERSITY
MAIN DALMIA ROAD, KARACHI. PHONE:021-99240255

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF CONSULTANTS SELECTION COMMITTEE FOR APPOINTMENT OF CONSULTANTS FOR PREPARATION OF FEASIBILITY REPORT, PRELIMINARY DESIGN, PC-I DOCUMENT ETC OF HAWKS BAY ELEVATED FREEWAY, KARACHI

Date: March 12, 2015

Venue: Office of Lyari Development Authority,
Apolo Centre, PNS Raza, Karachi

Participants:

(a) Mr. Abdul Aziz Memon	Superintending Engineer, LDA	(Chairman)
(b) Mr. Sikandar Ali Shaikh	T&C Section / P&D Department GOS	(Member)
(c) Dr. Aijaz Alam	Deputy Secretary (Dev-I)	
	Finance Department, GOS	(Member)
(d) Mr. Ali Abbas	Deputy Director (F&A)	
	Finance Department, LDA	(Member)
(e) Mr. Agha Mohammad Ali	Executive Engineer, LDA	(Member/Secretary)

1. The Chair welcomed the committee members.
2. The Secretary of the Committee informed that the meeting has been called to finalize the RFP, Cost Estimates and Procurement Advertisement for hiring of consultants for the "Preparation of Feasibility Study, Preliminary Design, Cost Estimates, PC-1, etc. for Hawksbay Elevated Expressway (11.4 kms) for which the Government of Sindh has approved the PC-II and has mandated the LDA to get the works done.
3. The Chairman of the Committee started the proceedings by informing the following agenda in line with the SPPRA Rules 2010 and their subsequent amendments:
 - (a) Finalization of the Mode of Procurement
 - (b) Finalization of the Terms of Reference (ToR) and RFP (Request for Proposals) documents as per rules 66(1) & 66(5) of SPPRA Rules.
 - (c) Finalization of Cost Estimates as per rule 66(2) of SPPRA rules.
 - (d) Finalization of the RFP (Request for Proposals) documents as per rule 66(5) of SPPRA Rules.
 - (e) Finalization of Advertisement for the assignment.
4. Following are the deliberations & decisions of the meeting:
 - a) **FINALIZATION OF TOR:**
The participants were briefed that the PC-II of the scheme has been approved by the Govt. of Sindh which contains the Terms of reference of the Project based on



LYARI DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY

1ST FLOOR, APOLO CENTRE, ADJACENT TO BEHERIA UNIVERSITY
MAIN DALMIA ROAD, KARACHI. PHONE:021-99240255

which the draft Tor were prepared. The participants went through the draft ToR and found it as per the requirements of the project. The same were therefore approved.

b) FINALIZATION OF COST ESTIMATES FOR THE ASSIGNMENT:

It was observed that since the PC-II of the project has already been approved which contains the Cost Estimates, the same would be adopted which are adequate for the assignment.

c) MODE OF PROCUREMENT:

It was observed that as per SPPRA Rule 66, the Client, if deem necessary, may opt for calling of Expression of Interest and Shortlist the Consultants. After detailed deliberations, it was decided that this clause will not be invoked as the project is of urgent nature and going through the EoI process will require at least 30 days time before any RFP is issued. It was therefore decided that direct RFP be solicited from the interested consultants and the Single Stage – Two Envelope (SSTE) Process (as per Rule 46(2) be adopted for the current procurement.

The selection method was deliberated in detail. It was observed that given the nature of works i.e. specialized works for an elevated expressway, the available expertise in the country is very limited. It was also observed that the out-put of the consultants will be of paramount importance in execution of the project and quality of consultancy works will have a direct impact on the cost and feasibility of this mega project. After deliberations, two options of selection methods given in SPPRA were shortlisted i.e. Quality Based Selection (Rule 72(2) of SPPRA and Quality & Cost Based Selection (Rule 72(3) of SPPRA) as follows:

72 (2) Quality Based Selection Method –

- (a) this method shall be used only in case of highly specialized, innovative and complex assignments, where quality is the only factor taken into consideration.*
- (b) in Quality Based Selection method the technical proposal which attains the highest score according to the criteria mentioned in the bidding documents shall be selected without any consideration for cost.*
- (c) the selected firm shall be asked to submit its financial proposal and invited to negotiate the financial proposal and the contract.*

72 (3) Quality and Cost Based Selection Method - This method shall be used only where;

- (a) the Terms of Reference are well-defined and Quality is of prime consideration, while cost is a secondary consideration;*
- (b) the firm which attains the highest combined weighted technical and financial score according to the criteria mentioned in the bidding documents shall be selected..*

It was the consensus opinion of the participants that QCBS is a better system of selection as it considers the cost impact also while ensuring that the highest quality of services are received. It was also observed that for the consultancy services procurement for the recent mega projects of similar magnitude like Karachi



LYARI DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY

1ST FLOOR, APOLO CENTRE, ADJACENT TO BEHERIA UNIVERSITY
MAIN DALMIA ROAD, KARACHI. PHONE:021-99240255

Greenline BRTS Project which is of similar magnitude but has much lesser elevated structure, the QCBS Method is being adopted.

In view of above, the QCBS was approved for the current assignment.

d) **ADVERTISEMENT FOR PROCUREMENT:**

The draft advertisement was reviewed by the committee and was found to be in conformity with the requirements of the SPPRA Rules. The same was therefore approved.

e) **RFP DOCUMENTS:**

The draft RFP documents were reviewed in detail and it was observed that the same are in conformity with the requirements of the project and the SPPRA Rules and were therefore approved.

There being no other point, the meeting was concluded with thanks to and from the chair.


Member/Secretary
(Executive Engineer)
Lyari Development Authority